Steve Naragon 1 of 16

## INTERNET RESOURCES FOR TRANSLATING KANT

Translating a text requires a number of skills and resources. The skills require time and practice, but many of the resources are now available on the internet. This essay briefly considers the following kinds of resources available to translators of Kant's texts: (1) the source text (early and critical editions), (2) previous translations, along with reviews and discussions of those translations, and (3) dictionaries relevant to 18th century German, and lexicons and glossaries specific to Kant's texts. The focus is on translation, but translating Kant also involves understanding the philosophical world in which the text was written, and that involves some basic historical research. Therefore much of the following extends beyond the relatively narrow confines of mere translation.

Most readers will already be familiar with many of these resources and all will be familiar with some. My intention here is to gather up in one place what most of us already know, along with a few internet resources that may still count as novelties for some. In similar fashion I have tried to gather up in one place the links to many of these basic internet resources on a single page of the website *Kant in the Classroom* [http://users.manchester.edu/FacStaff/SSNaragon/Kant/]. I'll refer to pages on this website with truncated addresses in order to reduce the clutter (thus, [Kant/Helps/AcadEd.htm] instead of [http://users.manchester.edu/FacStaff/SSNaragon/Kant/Helps/AcadEd.htm]), and at the close of this essay I'll offer a brief overview of the website itself. Rather than read this essay, you could turn directly to the collection of internet resources available at [http://users.manchester.edu/FacStaff/SSNaragon/Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslationsLinks.htm].

### I. The Source Text

A complete list of Kant's published writings is available at [Kant/Helps/KantsWritings.htm], arranged chronologically, but there is also an "alphabetized name index" with variant names (in English) for locating a text when the proper title can't be recalled (e.g., 'physician' will locate Kant's "Nachricht an Ärzte"), as well as the standard list of abbreviations used by *Kant-Studien* for citing Kant's texts in the Academy edition. Clicking on the name of a text will open a window with a standard short title in English, the full title in German, first publication data, a full title in English, and a select

The purpose of this website (first available in 2006) was to offer background information regarding the many student lecture notes stemming from Kant's classroom – thus the title (it was not intended to be a resource for teaching Kant's texts "in the classroom") – but a significant part of the website has always been devoted to basic information on Kant's life and writings, and this latter information is accessed more often than the lecture-related material. It is this part of the website that is most relevant to the present article.

I wish to apologise for the website's focus on English-reading audiences; this focus was due in part to my own linguistic limitations and in part to the need to limit the scope of the work involved.

Steve Naragon 2 of 16

number of translations into English, but always including those in the *Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*. Most entries conclude with a brief note on the compositional or publication history of the text, and whether that text was reprinted in Tieftrunk's 1799/1807 collection of Kant's shorter writings.<sup>3</sup> When available, I include an image of the title page and provide its "Warda number" (viz., the number assigned to that particular edition in Warda's 1919 bibliography of Kant's publications).<sup>4</sup>

The Academy edition (Akademie Ausgabe; normally abbreviated 'AA' or 'Ak') of Kant's writings – Kant's gesammelte Schriften (29 vols., 1900ff.)<sup>5</sup> – is the default critical edition for Kant's texts. Wilhelm Dilthey (1833-1911) inaugurated this edition in 1894 and served as its first general editor. The volumes are grouped into four divisions: (1) published writings, vols. 1-9, (2) correspondence, vols. 10-13, (3) literary remains or Nachlaß, vols. 14-23, and (4) student notes from Kant's lectures, vols. 24-29. The first three divisions have been available online since 2008 as the Bonner Kant Korpus, supported by the Institut für Kommunikationsforschung und Phonetik at the Universität Bonn [https://korpora.zim.uni-duisburg-essen.de/Kant]. The online text is page- and line-true to the printed text and is fully searchable [https://korpora.zim.uni-duisburg-essen.de/Kant/suche.html]. Other features of that site include an online version of the 1969 Personenindex and online versions of five textbooks that Kant used in his lectures: Gottfried Achenwall's Juris Naturalis (1763) in the lectures on natural law, Alexander Gottlieb Baumgarten's Metaphysica (1757) in the lectures on metaphysics, anthropology, and natural theology, Baumgarten's Initia Philosophiae Practicae (1760) in the moral philosophy lectures, Johann August Eberhard's Vorbereitung zur natürlichen Theologie (1781) in the natural theology lectures alongside Baumgarten, and Georg Friedrich Meier's Auszug aus der Vernunftlehre (1752) in the logic lectures. Kant's copies of Baumgarten's *Metaphysica* and Meier's *Auszug* are extant; the others were lost or destroyed during World War II, although Kant's marginalia had already been transcribed and published in the Academy edition; for more on these textbooks see [Kant/Lectures/lecturesTextbooks.htm].

Kant authorized Johann Friedrich Tieftrunk (1760-1837), a professor at Halle, to publish his shorter writings, making this the first *authorized* edition of Kant's writings, although in his 13 October 1797 letter to Tieftrunk, Kant asked him to omit everything published before 1770 ("I agree to your proposal to publish a collection of my minor writings, but I would not want you to start the collection with anything before 1770") – a request that Tieftrunk ignored.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Arthur Warda, *Die Druckschriften Immanuel Kants (bis zum Jahre 1838)*. Wiesbaden: Verlag von Heinrich Staadt, 1919 – and available at [Kant/Helps/Warda1919.html].

Kant's gesammelte Schriften. 29 vols. Edited by the Königlich Preußischen Akademie der Wissenschaften (vols. 1-16), Preußischen Akademie der Wissenschaften (vols. 17-22), Deutschen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin (vols. 23-24), Akademie der Wissenschaften der DDR (vol. 27), Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen (vol. 28-29), Berlin-Brandenburgischen Akademie der Wissenschaften (vols. 25-26). Berlin: Georg Reimer, 1900-1922; Walter de Gruyter, 1923 ff.

Steve Naragon 3 of 16

A detailed overview of the Academy edition is available at [Kant/Helps/AcadEd.htm]. While consisting of twenty-nine volumes, there are actually thirty-nine bound books, since all of the volumes from division four (the student lecture notes) consist of multiple partial volumes.<sup>6</sup> This fecundity of partial volumes makes an overview especially helpful for quickly locating texts and the various editorial materials (e.g., introductions, explanatory notes, and the philological notes listed as 'Textänderungen und Lesarten' – material that anyone translating these texts will want to consult). Kant's *Nachlaβ*, the third division of the Academy edition, consists of his unpublished notes and reflections, including annotations to his textbooks and loose notes (vols. 14-19), drafts and revisions of published writings, Kant's notes in his personal copies of *Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and Sublime* (1764) and his *Critique of Pure Reason* (1781), along with correspondence discovered after vols. 10-13 had been published (vols. 20, 23), and the *opus postumum* (vols. 21-22). Erich Adickes edited and saw to completion volumes 14-18, with his assistant Friedrich Berger finishing vol. 19 after Adickes' death in 1928. The texts in these volumes are especially rich, but also baffling to the uninitiated, so additional explanatory material is offered here in the online overview.

It is widely understood that there are problems with the Academy edition. Some texts were placed in the wrong division, some volumes were poorly edited or transcribed (in general, those by Gerhard Lehmann – vols. 20-23 of the *Nachlaß*, and vols. 24, 27-29 of the student lecture notes). Some texts in other volumes have been made obsolete by newer editions and, in a general sense, the Weischedel edition of Kant's published writings is more reliably edited, although it omits a number of minor writings.<sup>7</sup> Fortunately, locating parallel texts of different editions of Kant's writings is made significantly easier by the *Kant-Seitenkonkordanz* prepared by Hinske and Weischedel.<sup>8</sup>

There are also additional letters and *Nachlaß* discovered since the publication of the Academy volumes, and in particular there are a number of student lecture notes that are either unpublished

Only the first part of vol. 26 (Lectures on Physical Geography) has been published so far, but it is expected that the remainder will be published as two additional partial volumes. This will complete the edition as it was originally planned.

Fankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp Verlag, 1968), and ten (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1968) volumes. All three editions have identical pagination. The first two editions are essentially identical in all details, the Suhrkamp edition being uncorrected from the Insel edition. The ten volume edition, on the other hand, was specially revised and corrected from the Insel six volume edition, with volumes 1, 2, 4, and 6 divided into two volumes each.

Norbert Hinske and Wilhelm Weischedel, *Kant-Seitenkonkordanz*. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1970; xv, 299 p. This reference work includes the original editions of Kant's writings as well as the location of the text in the following collections: Rosenkranz/Schubert (12 vols., 1838-42), Hartenstein (10 vols., 1838-39), Hartenstein (8 vols., 1867-68), Kirchmann (12 vols., 1870-91), the Akademie-Ausgabe (29 vols., 1900f.), Vorländer (10 vols., 1920-29), Cassirer (11 vols., 1912-22), and Weischedel (6, 12, and 10 vols., 1956-64, 1968). See especially the "Inhaltsverzeichnis der verglichenen Ausgaben" (pp. 271-299).

Steve Naragon 4 of 16

altogether or else published elsewhere – a list of these can be found at [Kant/Notes/notesListUnpublished.htm].

In addition to the Kant texts available in the *Bonner Kant Korpus*, the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences also offers four online texts at [http://kant.bbaw.de/online-editionen]: (1) *Tugendlehre*: a PDF file noting the variations between the 1797 and 1803 editions. (2) *Opus postumum*: while not yet complete, this provides facsimiles of the original manuscripts and metadata linking the transcription to the corresponding text as printed in the Academy edition (vols. 21 and 22). (3) *Vorlesungen über physische Geographie*: this companion website to vol. 26 of the Academy edition offers a wealth of supporting materials, along with the transcriptions of the physical geography lecture notes. (4) *Herder's "Notizen zu Metaphysik"*: this website is a first draft of a new transcription of Herder's notes from Kant's metaphysics lectures, and will soon be replaced by a website including all of Herder's student notes from Kant's lectures (primarily the notes on metaphysics, moral philosophy, and physical geography).

Locating and acquiring the actual texts of early editions has been greatly aided by the development and continued growth of several book digitization projects, the largest being *GoogleBooks*, where (at least in theory) books no longer under copyright protection may be freely downloaded as PDF files. Not long ago these PDFs were non-searchable images – the end-user needed to process them, after downloading, with an optical character recognition (OCR) program – and German texts printed in Fraktur-type were typically resistant to these programs. That has since changed, and the downloadable PDFs from *GoogleBooks* now appear to come with the appropriate metadata to allow for searching (and with lines of texts identified so that they can be marked and highlighted). The word recognition is far from perfect – not finding a term in a search is merely *suggestive* that the term isn't there – but this is vastly better than what was available only a few years ago.

One note with *GoogleBooks*: finding a book is not entirely straight-forward, and different routes and search strings should be attempted before concluding that it is unavailable. At fortune's other end, multiple copies of a book are often available but some will be better than others. Downloading several of these while you have them located is often helpful, since it is not uncommon to discover a blurred or missing page (a result of scanning errors) or that the page of a particular scanned copy is itself illegible.

GoogleBooks [https://books.google.com], a commercial – yet currently cost- and advertising-free – venture of Alphabet Inc., aims to scan "everything ever published" and is clearly the giant in the field, but occasionally a text unavailable there can be found on one of several other academic and non-profit platforms. Gallica [https://gallica.bnf.fr] is the digital library of the Bibliothèque nationale

Steve Naragon 5 of 16

de France, including holdings from over 300 partner libraries. It has been online since 1997 and currently has nearly five million documents available (manuscripts, maps, musical scores, and other print media, images, video, and sound files), and which can be viewed online or downloaded. Biblioteca Digital Hispánica [http://www.bne.es/es/Catalogos/BibliotecaDigitalHispanica/Inicio/index.html], the digital collection of the Biblioteca Nacional de España, has 218 thousand items available online.

The *HathiTrust* [https://www.hathitrust.org] was founded in 2008 by a group of North American universities and now has 140 institutional members, the majority in North America, with over 60 of these institutions contributing data to the collection, resulting in a total of almost 17 million items, one-half of which are book titles. The interface to the books allows for easy online use of the texts, but individual pages may also be downloaded as PDF files (downloading entire volumes requires the individual to hold an account through a subscribing institution). The majority of the books are in English, although some 400 languages are represented in the collection.

The *Internet Archive* [https://archive.org] is a non-profit library of digitized books, movies, software, music, and websites. Online since 1996 with an original goal of archiving what was then a rather new invention – "the internet" with its many ephemera. Currently 279 billion web pages are archived here – along with books and texts (11 million), audio recordings (4 million), videos (3 million), images (1 million), and software programs (100,000) – all free for downloading.

Several German university libraries also have advanced digitization projects. The Münchener Digitalisierungs Zentrum (MDZ) [https://www.digitale-sammlungen.de] is the digital library of the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek (BSB) with over 900,000 titles available for download. This database can also be searched through the ZVDD and the DBB. The Zentrales Verzeichnis Digitalisierter Drucke (ZVDD) [http://www.zvdd.de/startseite/] is the portal for all digitized German publications and is coordinated by the AG Sammlung Deutscher Drucke and the Niedersächsische Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Göttingen. It currently has about 1.7 million titles available for viewing online or downloading, and can be found by title, author, publisher, place of publication, publication date, or a range of dates. The Deutsche Digitale Bibliothek (DDB) [https://www.deutsche-digitalebibliothek.de] is a national portal for accessing digitized versions of various kinds of cultural artifacts: books, images, sculptures, music, films, scores – over 24 million objects in all. The materials have all been curated by member institutions (over 4000 and growing), and its fully developed version went online in 2014. Search results occur in a common window, and clicking on a hit will open a page with basic data on the item and with links to the appropriate page of the institution actually holding the item. Finally, the *Deutschen Textarchivs* (DTA) [http://www.deutschestextarchiv.de] – an initiative of the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences – has a growing body of scanned, annotated, and downloadable texts dating from the 17th through the 19th centuries (3848 texts, as of

Steve Naragon 6 of 16

this writing), and is intended to serve as the "basis for a reference corpus of the New High German language."

An online resource dedicated to 18<sup>th</sup> century German philosophical texts has recently been developed by *The Kant Research Group* at The University of Western Ontario: *Digital Archive of 18<sup>th</sup> Century German Texts* [http://publish.uwo.ca/~cdyck5/UWOKRG/digitalarchive.html]. These texts are alphabetically arranged by author – as of November 2018, they extend from "Abbt, Thomas" to "Zwanziger, Johann Christian" – listing under each author the relevant publications which are in turn linked to an offsite webpage offering a digital PDF copy. This is quite the time-saver and a good first stop when looking for an online copy of an 18<sup>th</sup> century German text.<sup>9</sup>

Periodicals from 18th century Germany are available online at the *Retrospektive* Digitalisierungwissenschaftlicher Rezensionsorgane und Literaturzeitschriften des 18. und 19. Jahrhunderts aus dem deutschen Sprachraum [http://ds.ub.uni-bielefeld.de/viewer/]. This platform houses a number of collections, including "Journals of the German Enlightenment," which claims to contain a "complete corpora of review organs and literary magazines of the German Enlightenment." This is not quite true, but it does contain 196 journals, including Friedrich Nicolai's Allgemeine deutsche Bibliothek (Berlin/Stettin 1765-94), Biester and Gedike's Berlinische Monatsschrift (Berlin 1783-1811), the *Briefe, die Neueste Litteratur betreffend*, edited by Gotthold Ephraim Lessing, Moses Mendelssohn, and Nicolai (Berlin/Stettin, 1759-66), the short-lived Der Philosoph für die Welt, edited by J. J. Engel (Leipzig 1775-1777), and Christoph Martin Wieland's Der Teutsche Merkur (Weimar 1775-1777) – all important in Kant's world, and he published nearly all of his essays in the Berlinische Monatsschrift after its founding. One notable omission in the above list of periodicals is the Allgemeine Literatur-Zeitung, edited by Christian Gottfried Schütz and Gottlieb Hufeland, first in Jena (1785-1803), then moving to Halle in 1804. This was a daily (except Sunday) four-page paper filled primarily with book reviews and it offered an important stage for defending and furthering Kant's critical philosophy. Fortunately this journal (along with a thousand others) is available in digiPress, the portal for digitized periodicals of the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek (BSB) [https://digipress.digitale-sammlungen.de]. This platform also includes non-German periodicals and has a quite useful search function, including a "calendar view" that displays the availability of volumes and issues of a particular periodical.

A slightly smaller collection of digital periodical literature is sponsored by the Thüringer Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek Jena (ThULB) as part of their "Universal Multimedia Electronic

Several related projects are also to be found here, and these are equally well-formatted: *Kant's Books* (compiling links to digital texts of books listed in the Warda 1922 bibliography or that we otherwise have good reason to believe that Kant owned or had read) and *Women Intellectuals of Eighteenth-Century Germany*.

Steve Naragon 7 of 16

Library" (UrMEL), which offers digital access to a collection of 1539 periodicals [https://zs.thulb.uni-jena.de/content/main/journalList.xml]. On this platform, the body of texts can be searched directly and the periodical titles can be browsed alphabetically and filtered by type (Addressbücher, Kalendarien, Parlamentsschriften, Zeitschriften, Zeitungen) and subject matter. They also have the *Allgemeine Literatur-Zeitung* in their collection, and with what I find to be an easier interface for accessing the texts.

#### II. Previous Translations

A bibliography of translations is being assembled on the *Kant in the Classroom* website at [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm] and hopes to include the first edition (and significantly revised editions) of each translation of Kant's published writings, as well as of his *Nachlaß*, correspondence, and the student lecture notes, and these are listed chronologically by date of the original Kant publication, and then by date of the translation publication.

GoogleBooks and related digitization efforts are important sources for acquiring a text, but a previous step is discovering whether a text exists at all and in what library it might be found, and this step is facilitated by catalogs of library holdings. The first large-scale online public access catalog (OPAC) began in 1975 with The Ohio State University collection. Despite some resistance to losing the old card catalogs (many of which formed elegant works of informational art), it is now difficult to imagine a major library whose catalog is not yet online. Long before this, a great many of these catalogs were aggregated into what in print was called a "union catalog," the largest being those well-worn olive-green *National Union Catalog* volumes that aimed to include the holdings of all major US and Canadian libraries – the German counterparts are the blue and orange *Gesamtverzeichnis des deutschsprachigen Schrifttums*. <sup>10</sup>

The content of these union catalogs has yet to be entirely replaced by electronic databases, but the universal accessibility and up-to-date entries make the latter much more useful for most of us. The largest of these electronic catalogs is *WorldCat* [https://www.worldcat.org/advancedsearch] (72,000 libraries; over 434 million records representing 2.6 billion holdings), maintained by the Online Computer Library Center (OCLC) and with the data crowd-sourced by its participating libraries. Other online public access catalogs (OPACs) include *The European Library* [http://www.theeuropeanlibrary.org/tel4/] (a "portal to the 48 national libraries of Europe"; 175 million records – unfortunately this portal was frozen at the end of 2016 with no further updates since then), *COPAC* [https://copac.jisc.ac.uk] (Consortium of Online Public Access Catalogues, combining the

Literature between 1700-1910 (160 vols.) and literature between 1911-1965 (150 vols.) published by K. G. Saur Verlag (Munich).

Steve Naragon 8 of 16

catalogs of over 100 major UK and Irish libraries, including the British Library; 40 million records), GVK [https://gso.gbv.de] (Gemeinsamer Verbundkatalog, joining the catalogs of 400 libraries; 32.7 million records), DNB [https://portal.dnb.de] (Deutsche National Bibliothek; the national repository library for all German and German-language publications after 1913, including translations of these publications; 34.2 million records), BnF [https://catalogue.bnf.fr/] (Bibliothèque nationale de France, the national repository library of France; over 15 million records), BnE [http://www.bne.es/es/Catalogos] (Biblioteca Nacional de España, the national repository library of Spain; 26 million records), PORBASE [http://www.bnportugal.gov.pt] (Base Nacional de Dados Bibliográficos, the online union catalog for Portugual), SBN [https://opac.sbn.it/opacsbn/opac/iccu/avanzata.jsp] (Catalogo del Servizio Bibliotecario Nazionale, the online public access catalog of the Italian Union Catalog; over 17 million records), LoC [https://catalog.loc.gov] (Library of Congress, the national repository library for the United States; 17 million records), and KVK [https://kvk.bibliothek.kit.edu] (Karlsruher Virtueller Katalog; first developed in 1996). This last search-platform (KVK) brings together the catalogs of research libraries in German-speaking lands and offers a record base of over 600 million books, but the search interface also allows the user to select from dozens of catalog systems world-wide, including WorldCat, and even the major catalogs from the book trade like abebooks, Amazon, and ZVAB (Zentrales Verzeichnis antiquarischer Bücher). Finally, the ZDB [https://zdbkatalog.de/index.xhtml] – the Zeitschriften Datenbank or German Union Catalogue of Serials – is administered by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek and the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin Stiftung Preußischer Kulturbesitz. According to its website, it catalogs nearly 17 million holdings from 3700 German and Austrian libraries, including 1.9 million title records, 282 thousand monograph series, 63 thousand newspapers, and 214 thousand e-journals.

With the advanced search form in *WorldCat*, one is able to filter the search by publication year, audience (juvenile/non-juvenile), content (fiction, non-fiction, biography, thesis/dissertation), language (any one of thirty; the default is "all"). With a *WorldCat* account (typically through a library, and most academic libraries in the U.S. seem to subscribe to this) one has access to the normally much more useful "First Search" form, where one has the same 30 languages to choose from as well as "all" and "other" options. If you choose "other" you can then include your language of choice as a "language-phrase" and have hits returned for just that language — as well as being able to employ additional filters, such as format (large print, braille, manuscript, microform, CD audio, and so on).

Apart from *WorldCat*, the European Library (*TEL*) platform is the most useful in terms of the scope of its records and the filters available for searches, although the future of this platform seems to be up in the air. A few sample searches offer some sense of how these databases compare. For

Steve Naragon 9 of 16

instance, Basque is not one of the standard thirty menu-item languages in *WorldCat* but a search of books with 'Kant' as the author and 'Basque' entered as a language-phrase in *WorldCat* will generate nineteen items (as of November 2018) – all involving texts by Kant translated into Basque.

For end-users engaged in bibliographical research (as opposed to someone looking to borrow a book from a particular library), the greatest problem with *WorldCat* is the duplication of records, leaving the user with a much longer list to sift through. The list of Basque translations is short enough that the duplications cause little bother, but it offers a good indication of the scope of the problem: nineteen hits reduce to just six actual texts. There is also less standardization than desirable and occasional inconsistencies between the duplications. Of course, for the purposes of translators these problems are negligible, since one is generally interested in discovering whether a publication exists at all. In this same search for Basque translations, *WorldCat* found the most titles (six), with thirteen redundancies. The European Library came in second with four titles (missing the two titles where a work of Kant appeared in a collection with other authors) but also with only three redundancies. The *GVK*, even with its 400 libraries and 32.7 million titles, did not return a single Basque translation; likewise with the *BnF*. The *DNB* offered nine hits (using "bask\*" as a keyword), but seven of these were irrelevant, and the *KVK* platform, while capable of accessing a vast number of records, is not capable of filtering a search by language.

A second test searched for editions of Kant's precritical "Versuch den Begriff der negativen Größen in die Weltweisheit einzuführen" (1st edition: 1763, 2nd edition: 1797). Here the publicly-available *WorldCat* gave the most useful results with nine hits: the 1763 and 1797 editions, three modern editions, and one hit each for translations in English, French, Slovenian, and Greek. The *WorldCat* "First Search" (the default search interface with an institutional subscription) gives thirty-seven hits, but those extra hits were all redundant. *GVK* gave eight hits (the 1763 and 1797 editions, a 1st edition reprint, and the French translation), while the *DNB*, with its five hits, included the Greek translation (along with two separate editions of the French translation), and the 1763 edition with a modern reprint, but no 1797 edition. *COPAC*, just three hits, gave the 1763 edition, a modern edition, and the French translation. These are limited spot checks, but they both show that *WorldCat* is more exhaustive in its scope, as well as suffering from excessive duplication.

Once a translation is located, it is worth remembering that useful discussions of translations are often found in the translator's own prefaces and in book reviews of the translations [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#Rev]. Of the English translations of the *Critique of Pure Reason*, for instance, Max Mueller (1881, xxvii-xxxiii), Wolfgang Schwarz (1982, pp. xiii-xxxi), and Werner Pluhar (1996, xvii-xxiii) all have especially interesting discussions, similarly Jens Timmermann's preface to his translation of the *Grundlegung* (2011, ix-xiv) – to name just a few.

Steve Naragon 10 of 16

## III. German dictionaries, Kant lexicons, and glossaries

Nearly anyone working in a second language and who is perpetually online will have a favorite online "go to" dictionary for translation suggestions. *LEO* [https://www.dict.leo.org] and *Linguee* [https://www.linguee.com] are perhaps the two most popular. These, of course, are multi-lingual dictionaries translating from one language into another, and their register is non-technical and popular. 11

Monolingual dictionaries offer a different level of assistance to translators, and two online resources with rather larger datasets and more historical depth than either *Leo* or *Linguee* are the *Digitales Wörterbuch der deutschen Sprache* (*DWDS*) [https://www.dwds.de] and the *Deutsches Wörterbuch von Jacob Grimm und Wilhelm Grimm* (*DWB*) [http://woerterbuchnetz.de/cgibin/WBNetz/wbgui\_py?sigle=DWB]. The Grimm dictionary is part of the *Wörterbuchnetz* sponsored by the Trier Center for Digital Humanities [http://woerterbuchnetz.de], where one finds a number of other valuable online resources as well, including the *Adelung Wörterbuch* and the *Goethe-Wörterbuch*. The *DWDS* platform already includes the Grimm database in its searches, so in principle the former alone could be used without loss, but I have found the Grimm dictionary interface particularly helpful when puzzling over archaic terms.

In general, 18<sup>th</sup> century dictionaries are quite useful for translators of 18<sup>th</sup> century texts, and we are fortunate to have several good editions of dictionaries available from *GoogleBooks* and elsewhere (links to which are available at [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslationsLinks.htm#Dictionaries]), in case the books aren't already sitting on your shelf. Monolingual editions include Joachim Heinrich Campe's five-volume *Wörterbuch der deutschen Sprache* (1807–13), Johann August Eberhard's *Synonymisches Handwörterbuch der deutschen Sprache* (1802), Wilhelm Müller's three-volume *Mittelhochdeutsches Wörterbuch* (1854-63), and two dictionaries focussed on Kant's Prussian: the

At a rather different level are online translators such as *GoogleTranslate* and *DeepL* that can translate phrases, sentences, and entire documents. *GoogleTranslate* is one of Alphabet Inc.'s many "free" products; one should perhaps assume that the parent company is making money with this service, but how this happens is not obvious to me. Thankfully there are no advertisements with either this or *DeepL*, a translator commercially-affiliated with the *Linguee* suite of dictionaries, and which offers both a free version as well as *DeepL Pro* (for a monthly subscription). As of 2018, *DeepL* translates between English, German, French, Spanish, Portuguese, Dutch, Italian, Polish, and Russian, while *GoogleTranslate* supports over 100 languages, at varying levels of accuracy. Both programs allow for translating passages of text (that is either typed or copied into the web-browser window) as well as entire documents (uploaded from a file directory in *GoogleTranslate* or with drag-and-drop in *DeepL*). The output with document translation is editable with *GoogleTranslate* but not with the free-version of *DeepL* (editable translations is one feature of *DeepL Pro*). My admittedly limited checking of German-to-English translation found that *DeepL* offers a more natural output than *GoogleTranslate*.

Steve Naragon 11 of 16

*Idioticon Prussicum* (1759) prepared by Kant's older colleague Johann Georg Bock, and Georg Hennig's *Preußisches Wörterbuch* (1785) – both published in Königsberg.<sup>12</sup>

We also have available a selection of German-English dictionaries: Johann Anton Fahrenkrüger's two-volume *Nathan Bailey's Dictionary. Englisch-deutsches und deutsch-englisches Wörterbuch* (1807-13), John Ebers's three-volume *The New and Complete Dictionary of the German and English Languages* (1796), and Flügel and Meissner's two-volume *A Complete Dictionary of the English and German and German and English Language* (3<sup>rd</sup> edition: 1856).<sup>13</sup>

Another 18<sup>th</sup> century reference tool available online but that you probably don't want on your shelf – because there are 64 volumes – is *Zedler's Universal-Lexikon* (*Grosses vollständiges Universal Lexicon aller Wissenschafften und Künste*, Leipzig, 1731-1754), published by Johann Heinrich Zedler and available as a searchable text at [https://www.zedler-lexikon.de/index.html]. PDF copies of individual pages as well as entire volumes can also be downloaded here. Opening Zedler is like walking straight into the 18<sup>th</sup> century; it helps contextualize and enliven the world surrounding the texts we translate.

A smaller encyclopedia but focussed just on the natural world is Johann Samuel Traugott Gehler's six-volume *Physikalisches Wörterbuch* (1789-1796).<sup>14</sup> Volume five is a supplement to the previous four volumes, and volume six is a set of indices that should be useful for translators, especially the indices of Latin technical terms, French technical terms, and authors and artists.

Several German-language Kant dictionaries or lexicons are also available digitally. These are particularly useful to translators wondering whether some term might have a technical meaning for Kant that needs closer attention in the translation, and here we have three from the eighteenth century, the first being C. C. E. Schmid's *Wörterbuch zum leichtern Gebrauch der Kantischen* 

Joachim Heinrich Campe, Wörterbuch der deutschen Sprache. 5 vols. Braunschweig: Schulbuchhandlung, 1807–13. Reprint: Hildesheim, Georg Olms Verlag, 1969-70; Johann August Eberhard, Synonymisches Handwörterbuch der deutschen Sprache für all, die sich in dieser Sprache richtig ausdrucken wollen. Halle: Schimmelpfennig und Compagnie, 1802; Wilhelm Müller, Mittelhochdeutsches Wörterbuch; mit Benutzung des Nachlasses von Georg Friedrich Benecke. 3 volumes in 4. Leipzig: S. Hirzel 1854, 1861, 1863; Johann Georg Bock, Idioticon Prussicum, oder Entwurf eines Preußischen Wörterbuches. Königsberg: Woltersdorfische Buchhandlung, 1759; Georg Ernst Sigismund Hennig, Preußisches Wörterbuch. Königsberg: Dengelsche Buchhandlung, 1785.

Johann Anton Fahrenkrüger, Nathan Bailey's Dictionary. English-German and German-English. Englisch-deutsches und deutsch-englisches Wörterbuch. Gänzlich umgearbeitet von Johann Anton Fahrenkrüger. 2 vols. 10th edition. Leipzig/Jena: Friedrich Frommann, 1801; John Ebers, The New and Complete Dictionary of the German and English Languages, composed chiefly after the German Dictionaries of Adelung and of Mr. Schwan. 3 vols. Leipzig: Breitkopf and Haertel, 1796; Flügel/Meissner, A Complete Dictionary of the English and German and English Languages, containing all the Words in General Use. Volume One: English and German, edited by Johann Gottfried Flügel. Volume Two: German and English, edited by Napoleon N. W. Meissner. Third edition. Leipzig: A. G. Liebeskind, 1856.

Johann Samuel Traugott Gehler, Physikalisches Wörterbuch, oder Versuch einer Erklärung der vornehmsten Begriffe und Kunstwörter der Naturlehre, mit kurzen Nachrichten von der Geschichte der Erfindungen und Beschreibungen der Werkzeuge begleitet. 6 vols. Leipzig: Schwickertschen Verlag, 1787, 1789, 1790, 1791, 1795, 1796.

Steve Naragon 12 of 16

Schriften (1786), significantly expanded in the 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (1788; 368 p.) and then nearly doubled in size by the fourth edition (1798; 616 pp). Samuel Heinicke's Wörterbuch zur Kritik der reinen Vernunft und zu den philosophischen Schriften von Herrn Kant (1788)<sup>15</sup> is considerably more concise, at 135 pages, but anyone feeling short-changed by either of these can turn to the multivolume dictionary prepared by Georg Samuel Albert Mellin, another of Kant's early promoters: Encyclopädisches Wörterbuch der kritischen Philosophie (1797-1804). 16 Consisting of six two-part volumes, with the parts of the first five volumes published separately, resulting in a work of eleven books totalling over 5000 pages, this resource has likely been underused simply because of its baffling size; but now that it is conveniently available through GoogleBooks, there is less reason not to take an occasional peek. The second part of volume six consists of a set of seven indices: (1) a list of all the articles (from 'A posteriori' to 'Zwittergrundsatz'), (2) a collection of references allowing the dictionary to serve as a commentary on Kant's writings, (3) a subject index, (4) Latin terms, (5) French terms, (6) authors, and (7) Greek terms. Translators should find this set of indices especially valuable, and page runs with links to the books are available on the *Kant in the Classroom* website. Mellin also published a one-volume Kunstsprache der kritischen Philosophie (1798) – also available online – for a quick orientation into Kant's technical language.

Eisler's Kant-Lexikon [https://www.textlog.de/rudolf-eisler.html] was published in book form in 1930<sup>17</sup> and reprinted since then, but now is available online as well as in a French translation by Anne-Dominique Balmès and Pierre Osmo (1994). I suspect the original German version will be consulted rather less often, however, now that a new three-volume German-language Kant-Lexikon (2015) has been published.<sup>18</sup> While not yet available online, I would be remiss not to mention this resource here; its breadth and organization makes it indispensible.

It should be noted here that Heinecke's publication is derivative – and at times badly copied – from Schmid's dictionary. Adickes describes it as "an almost verbal piracy of Schmid's *Wörterbuch...* only here and there occur alterations for the worse by Heinicke" (Erich Adickes, *German Kantian Bibliography*, Boston: Ginn & Co., 1896, p. 106).

Carl Christian Erhard Schmid, Woerterbuch zum leichtern Gebrauch der Kantischen Schriften, nebst einer Abhandlung. Jena: Cröker, 1786; Samuel Heinicke, Wörterbuch zur Kritik der reinen Vernunft und zu den philosophischen Schriften von Herrn Kant. Pressburg: Philip Ulrich Mahler, 1788; Georg Samuel Albert Mellin, Encyclopädisches Wörterbuch der kritischen Philosophie, oder Versuch einer fasslichen und vollständigen Erklärung der in Kants kritischen und dogmatischen Schriften enthaltenen Begriffe und Sätze, mit Nachrichten, Erläuterungen und Vergleichungen aus der Geschichte der Philosophie begleitet, und alphabetisch geordnet. 11 vols. Züllichau and Leipzig: Friedrich Frommann, 1797-1804. Reprint: Brussels, Aetas Kantiana, 1968.

Rudolf Eisler, Kant-Lexikon. Nachschlagewerk zu Kants sämtlichen Schriften, Briefen und handschriftlichem Nachlaβ. Berlin: E. S. Mittler, 1930. Reprint: Hildesheim, Georg Olms Verlag, 1984. French translation: Kant-Lexikon, 2 vols., translated and revised by Anne-Dominique Balmès and Pierre Osmo. Paris: Gallimard 1994.

Kant-Lexikon, 3 vols., edited by Marcus Willaschek, Jürgen Stolzenberg, Georg Mohr, and Stefano Bacin. New York/Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2015; an abridged one-volume student edition has also been released (de Gruyter 2017). More recent still is a one-volume Kleines Kant-Lexikon, edited by Larissa Berger and Elke Elisabeth Schmidt (Paderborn: Wilhelm Fink, 2018).

Steve Naragon 13 of 16

Apart from the French translation of Eisler's *Lexikon*, another resource is Roger Verneaux's two-volume *Le Vocabulaire de Kant*, <sup>19</sup> and in Spanish is Mario Caimi's recently published *Diccionario* (2017).<sup>20</sup>

There are also several English-language lexicons, although also unavailable digitally: Howard Caygill's A Kant Dictionary (1995) – also translated into Portuguese by Álvaro Cabral (2000),<sup>21</sup> Holzhey and Mudroch's Historical Dictionary of Kant and Kantianism (2005), <sup>22</sup> and Lucas Thorpe's *The Kant Dictionary* (2015).<sup>23</sup> The Holzhey/Mudroch volume offers both full articles on key terms as well as a quite long bilingual glossary (pp. 357-374), which brings us to the final resource for translators – glossaries. Several Kant glossaries have been available online: G. J. Mattey's Kant Lexikon [http://hume.ucdavis.edu/mattey/kant/LEXICON.HTM](quite brief) and Stephen Palmquist's Glossary of Kant's Technical Terms [http://staffweb.hkbu.edu.hk/ppp/ksp1/KSPglos.html](a bit longer), and we can add to these the useful glossary (pp. 261-281) in Wolfgang Schwarz's abridged translation of the Critique of Pure Reason (Scientia 1982)<sup>24</sup> and the glossary in Holzhey and Mudroch. All of the volumes in The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant include a bilingual glossary, as do many other translations — apart from Schwarz (1982), see especially Pluhar (Critique of Practical Reason 2002, pp. 233-242) and Stephen Palmquist's Comprehensive Commentary on Kant's Religion Within the Bounds of Bare Reason (Wiley 2015). Mirella Capozzi's Italian translation of the Jäsche Logic also contains a long bilingual glossary.<sup>25</sup> Some of these glossaries are simple word-lists, but others include quite useful discussions. In addition to these lexicons and glossaries, making use of the digital Kant texts at the Bonner Kant Korpus site allows for systematic word searches, providing a clear sense of whether some rendering of a word can be consistently applied.

One final online resource specifically related to Kant is *Kants naturtheoretische Begriffe* [http://knb.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/kant], a set of databases developed by Wolfgang Lefèvre and Falk

Roger Verneaux, *Le Vocabulaire de Kant, doctrines et méthodes*. Paris: Aubier-Montaigne, 1967; Roger Verneaux, *Le Vocabulaire de Kant, les Pouvoirs de l'esprit*. Paris: Aubier-Montaigne, 1973.

Mario Caimi, *Diccionario de la filosofia critica kantiana*. Buenos Aires: Colihue, 2017.

Howard Caygill, *A Kant Dictionary*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publ., 1995. Translated into Portuguese by Álvaro Cabral: *Dicionário Kant* (Rio de Janeiro: Jorge Zahar, 2000).

Helmut Holzhey and Vilem Mudroch, *Historical Dictionary of Kant and Kantianism*. Lanham, Maryland/Toronto/Oxford: The Scarecrow Press, 2005.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Lucas Thorpe, *The Kant Dictionary*. New York/London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Immanuel Kant, Critique of Pure Reason: concise text in a new, faithful, terminologically improved translation exhibiting the structure of Kant's argument in thesis and proof, edited and translated, and with an introduction by Wolfgang Schwarz. Aalen: Scientia, 1982.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Mirella Capozzi, ed. and tr., *Logica. Un manuale per lezioni*. Napoli: Bibliopolis, 1990, pp. 181-204.

Steve Naragon 14 of 16

Wunderlich (2008) and also available in a CD-ROM format. This resource facilitates the study of natural science concepts as they appear in Kant's pre-critical texts, and in particular with identifying conceptual relationships between the various texts. All of Kant's pre-critical texts are included: his published writings as well as relevant letters and *Nachlaβ*, and all the student notes that we have from Kant's physics lectures (Herder from 1763 – if the notes indeed stem from Kant – the Friedländer notes from 1776, and the Mrongovius notes from 1785). If you are working with these early texts, then it may be worth your time to become acquainted with this resource, which consists of several databases linked together: Kant's texts, contemporary scientific literature with which Kant would have been familiar (about 4000 titles), a list of 280 persons associated with Kant, and about 2200 concepts found in these texts. The person database can be browsed alphabetically or by century, with life dates and a few lines of biography for each individual and a list of the texts that mention them. The literature database is sorted by author, publication date, discipline, and so on.

My greatest concern with the website is that it does not appear to be fully functional (for instance, the German special characters don't display properly and error windows are frequent), and I have to admit to some early difficulties using the website – my test case with Herder's physics notes resulted in a discouraging ratio between information gained to time invested – but this may simply reflect a steep learning curve, and for some the climb should be worthwhile.

# IV. "Kant in the Classroom" as a Resource for Translating Kant

Translation is big business and there are many translation resources on the internet, although much is aimed at trade and industry rather than texts in the humanities. A few entry points into that larger world are *Zanata* [http://zanata.org], *Translator's Café* [https://www.translatorscafe.com/cafe/], PROZ [https://proz.com], and the official *IATE* (Interactive Terminology for Europe) that coordinates translation between the twenty-three official European languages [https://iate.europa.eu].

I have not come across any online resources specifically for translating Kant other than what little I've gathered together on my own website [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslationsLinks.htm], and I have included there all of the links mentioned in this essay, which I will now conclude with a brief overview of the website itself, offering a few user tips preceded by some background information.

The website came about through a collaboration with Werner Stark, who had coached me in reading the 18<sup>th</sup> century handwritten student notes from Kant's lectures. Long discussions with Stark about the notes and related matters led me to wonder how many Kant scholars understood what they were using when using these notes, and so we decided to co-author a short pamphlet that quickly outgrew pamphlet-size as well as developing features that challenged what books could do well. With the growing presence of web-based hyper-linked information it became clear that a website for

Steve Naragon 15 of 16

our little project was the best solution. So the heart of the "Kant in the Classroom" website is to serve as a resource for scholars wanting to make a more informed use of the student notes from Kant's lectures by offering them more complete information about the notes and lectures, as well as a great quantity of contextual information (about the nature of universities, student and professorial life, academic schedules, and so on). There are five main categories of information: Universities, Students, Professors, Kant's Lectures, and The Student Notes, and each of these has a half-dozen or so sub-categories.

Finally the website offers a set of basic resources for Kant studies in general, much of which I had been collecting over the years for my own use. These are the items in the far left column in the website's common header: Bibliography, Kant's Writings, Academy Edition, Glossary, Biographies, and Kant's Life. Of these, the most relevant to translation work is the overview of the Academy edition and the list of Kant's writings. Translating any of the lecture notes themselves will also be benefitted by a review of the relevant pages in the sections on "Kant's Lectures" [Kant/Lectures/lecturesIntro.htm] and "The Student Notes" [Kant/Notes/notesIntro.htm]. The website also offers lists of notes that have already been published (in the original or in translation) [Kant/Notes/PubNotesFrames.html] and of notes that have either not yet been published at all or are published, but not in the Academy edition [Kant/Notes/notesListUnpublished.htm]. Finally, there are a great many biographical sketches of Kant's contemporaries that include all of the Königsberg philosophy faculty from the eighteenth century as well as many others related to Kant [Kant/Bio/BioIntro.htm], although rather more breadth and depth is now available in the recently published *Dictionary of Eighteenth-Century German Philosophers* (2010).<sup>26</sup>

As mentioned above, the Kant website includes the beginnings of a bibliography of all the translations of Kant's writings (much of that shown is drawn from the *WorldCat* database) [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm]. These translations are listed by the original Kant text and arranged chronologically by publication date (first of the Kant text and then of the translation). I have often been surprised by their number and their nature. Thirty-nine languages are represented to date, and each entry is color-coded and tagged with an abbreviation of the language to facilitate searching. The bibliography aims to include the first edition of each translation, as well as significant revisions. Many translations are stand-alone publications, but most are published as part of small collections [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#Collections], and others belong to more comprehensive collected works of Kant in translation [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#Works].

Manfred Kuehn and Heiner Klemme, eds. *The Dictionary of Eighteenth-Century German Philosophers*, 3 vols. London/New York: Continuum, 2010.

Steve Naragon 16 of 16

Reviews of translations are collected in their own list and grouped by language [KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#Rev], as well as indicated with the relevant translation.

Several other working bibliographies are also being compiled on this page: Bibliographies of ... bibliographies of translations [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#BibKT], ... articles on translating Kant [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#LitTK], ... articles on specific Kant translation projects [Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#LitTP], ... books and articles on Kant studies, or the reception of Kant, in a particular language or country [KantsWritingsTranslations.htm#LitKR].

Any printed essay on the current state of some aspect of the internet is doomed to a hasty obsolescence. The internet is constantly growing – or rather 'expanding', to avoid any positive connotation – and it is doing this in any number of directions. And so a certain equanimity or foolishness is required to record any claims about the internet on something so stable and unyielding as ink on paper. The present essay is at best a snapshot of some ideas that once seemed useful. Only the internet can keep pace with the internet, so it would be best to stop reading this and instead consult the list of links at [http://users.manchester.edu/FacStaff/SSNaragon

/Kant/Helps/KantsWritingsTranslationsLinks.htm].<sup>27</sup>

**Abstract**: This essay briefly considers the following kinds of online resources for aiding translators of Kant's texts: (1) the source text (early and critical editions) to be translated, (2) previous translations, along with reviews and discussions of those translations, and (3) dictionaries relevant to 18th century German, and lexicons and glossaries specific to Kant's texts. The focus is on translation, but translating Kant also involves understanding the philosophical world in which the text was written, and that involves some basic historical research. Therefore the essay extends beyond the relatively narrow confines of simple translation.

Steve Naragon Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies Manchester University North Manchester, IN 46962 (USA)

Work on this essay and the accompanying web pages has been partially funded by a grant from the DAAD ("Research Stays for University Academics and Scientists, 2018"). For this, and for the many helpful suggestions and corrections by this volume's editors – Professors Schlüter and Hohenegger – I am most grateful.